



*Catherine E. Pugh*  
Mayor

**COMMISSION FOR  
HISTORICAL & ARCHITECTURAL  
PRESERVATION**

*Tom Liebel, Chairman*

**STAFF REPORT**



*Thomas J. Stosur*  
Director

**June 12, 2018**

**REQUEST:** Construct five-story addition along West Baltimore Street

**ADDRESS:** 1 North Carey (Union Square Historic District)

**PETITIONER(S):** 1 North Carey St. LLC, Owner  
Phillip Scott, Architect

**STAFF:** Walter W. Gallas and Caitlin Audette

**RECOMMENDATION:** Concept Approval

**SITE/HISTORIC DISTRICT**

General Area: The property is located in the Union Square Historic District at the northeast corner of North Carey and West Baltimore Streets. The Union Square local historic district is a dense area of rowhouses and commercial structures located in Southwest Baltimore. Two major features define the district: Union Square Park, a donation to the city in the 1840s, and Hollins Market with the city's oldest market building. Generally bounded by South Schroeder, West Pratt, South Fulton, and West Baltimore Streets, the area of approximately 21 blocks is comprised of over 1,000 buildings. The district is built on a hierarchical street-grid system laid down over gently sloping terrain by engineer-surveyor Thomas H. Poppleton following the land's 1816 annexation to the city.

Site Conditions

The existing property is a four-story commercial building at the corner of North Carey and West Baltimore Streets. The area where the proposed addition will be located is to the east of the existing building at the northwest corner of West Baltimore Street and Stockton Street. To the north of the existing vacant lot are three three-story rowhomes that face Stockton. Adjacent along West Baltimore Street, across Stockton Street is a one-story commercial building. Opposite West Baltimore Street are a variety of three-story commercial buildings.

The historic brick building at 1 North Carey was constructed in 1894. The building was constructed with funds from a legacy of Mr. Humphrey Moore, which created the Moore Institute. The building was immediately leased to the Y.M.C.A to fulfill Mr. Moore's legacy which as stated in the Baltimore Sun in 1894 was, "for the purpose of erecting in the western section of the city an institute or hall where young men could meet for literary purposes and debate the topics of the day." The building included an auditorium, classroom spaces, and a gymnasium. Today the building is in a state of disrepair with much of the interior completely demolished, many windows missing or removed and modified storefronts that are in disrepair.

The vacant lot where the proposed addition will be located historically housed two three-story brick rowhouses one of which houses a coin laundry and one which housed a store. The buildings were demolished by the city in 1995 following a fire that spurred their condemnation. Since the demolition the site has remained vacant.

## **BACKGROUND**

- June 4, 1995 – 1218 and 1220 W. Baltimore Street, the two rowhouses at the location of the proposed new addition, were condemned following a fire that caused the collapse of the roof and interior of the properties.
- September 13, 1995 – 1218 and 1220 W. Baltimore Street were demolished by city crews citing conditions dangerous to the public welfare.
- February 25, 2011 – Partial Condemnation Notice Issued by Housing.
- July 14, 2016 – Condemnation rescinded
- October 18, 2016 – CHAP staff walked site with architect and owner's representative.
- November 28, 2017 – Stop work order for construction work without permit.
- November 30, 2017 – Work without permit: Building fence around building without permits.
- February 15, 2018 – Work without permit: Construction of rear addition without approval.

## **PROPOSAL**

Applicant proposes to construct a new addition to the east of the existing building. The five-story addition would be mixed use with commercial space on the first floor and residential space on the second through fifth floors. This application does not include any work to the historic building. The owners have an ATP to clean and repair the masonry and remove vegetation from the building. No other exterior work is approved at this time. The applicant is expected to move forward with the full rehabilitation of the building in coordination with the new construction.

## **APPLICATION OF GUIDELINES**

- *Guideline 2.3 Scale and Form:* The existing vacant lots where the new construction will be located are surrounded by a variety of building types of different heights. The historic building at 1 North Carey is an exaggerated four-story building. To the north are three small scale three-story rowhomes that face Stockton. Along West Baltimore Street, across Stockton Street, is a one-story commercial building. Opposite West Baltimore Street are a variety of three-story commercial buildings. The proposed five-story building is shorter than the existing historic building at 1 North Carey. It is compatible with the variety of heights found in the surrounding buildings.

## **NEIGHBORHOOD COMMENTS**

The Union Square ARC was informed of the proposal. Members of the Union Square Association, at their meeting of June 14, 2018, had no objection to the addition, but expressed concerns about the materials to be used at the front façade.

## **ANALYSIS**

CHAP staff finds that the proposed mass and scale of the addition meets the guidelines for concept review. However, staff recommends that a number of changes to the design be completed so that the final design meets the guidelines.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

**Staff recommends concept approval of the mass and scale with final details to return to the full commission. Staff recommends that the architect explore the following design alternatives before returning to the full commission.**

- Space windows more evenly within the vertical plane, modifying the uppermost window to either be a tall window that responds to the lofted interior space (and resembles the double height window at the historic building), or a smaller window that helps create the cap to the building's composition.
- Revise the building's cornice to better relate to the historic building.
- Use double-hung windows rather than commercial sliding windows.
- Building materials should be compatible with the historic red brick building, taking design cues from the building.
- Remove the alternating brick colors. On a flat plane this styling is awkward. If the architect chose to create protruding bays, the use of an alternative material at this bay could be more appropriate. However, this would be a change to the massing that would need to be reviewed by the full commission. Additionally, a slightly recessed bay, similar to the historic building may give the appearance sought by the architect.
- At the side elevation the lintels and sills that extend from the stairwell windows should be removed.
- Modify the first floor cornice to more be more compatible with the cornice visible at the historic building's storefront.
- Revise the storefront to be more compatible with the historic building.



**Eric Holcomb**  
**Director**

## MAP AND IMAGES



*Image 1*– 1 N. Carey along West Baltimore Street in the Union Square Historic District.



*Image 2*: 1 N. Carey at corner of W. Baltimore Street and Stockton Street in the Union Square Historic District.





*Image 3:* Image of construction without a permit to begin construction of the new addition.



*Image 4:* Image of construction without a permit to begin construction of the new addition.





*Image 5: Image of construction without a permit to begin construction of the new addition.*



*Image 5: Aerial view of 1 N. Carey as seen from the west (December 2016)*



*Image 6: Aerial view of 1 N. Carey as seen from the south (December 2016)*